

COMMITTEE REPORT

Date: 21 October 2010 **Ward:** Guildhall
Team: West/Centre Area **Parish:** Guildhall Planning Panel

Reference: 10/00621/FUL
Application at: Stable Block Chapter House Street York
For: Conversion of coach house to provide a single dwellinghouse with external alterations including porch, new rooflights and solar panels and alterations to windows and doors.
By: Mr John Edwards
Application Type: Full Application
Target Date: 7 June 2010

Recommendation: Delegated Authority to Approve

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 An application for planning permission for the conversion of the coach house at Gray's Court was presented to Members at the West/ Centre Planning Sub-Committee on 18 September 2010. The application was deferred to allow the applicant to amend the scheme to address the following concerns as expressed in the previous recommendations-

a) The application proposals fail to demonstrate that parking for the proposed use and the displacement of existing parking and storage facilities from the building would not harm the character and appearance of the conservation area, the setting of nearby listed buildings and views from the adjacent city walls. As such the proposals would not meet the objectives of Policies HE2, HE3, HE4 and HE11 of the City of York Local Plan (2005) and policies HE 6.2, HE 7.2, HE 9.4 and 10.2 of Planning Policy Statement 5 " Planning for the Historic Environment, " by undervaluing the significance of the heritage asset as a whole, and by failing to acknowledge the contribution of the proposals to the wider setting and views of some of York's most valued heritage assets.

b) The proposed external alterations to the building including the size and number of rooflights, the introduction of solar panels, the erection of a porch, the vertical emphasis of new windows and doors and the loss of characteristic features such as the stable doors and taking-in hatches would reduce the utilitarian character of the building and harm the appearance of the building adversely affecting the character and appearance of the conservation area and the setting of nearby listed buildings. As such the proposals would not meet the objectives of policies HE2, HE3 and HE4 of the Development Control Local Plan or of policies contained within Planning Policy Statement 5 "Planning for the Historic Environment".

1.2 The officer's previous committee report is attached as Appendix 1.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest GMS Constraints: City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area GMS Constraints: Central Historic Core CONF

City Boundary GMS Constraints: York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams GMS Constraints: Central Area 0002

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 1; 1 Grays Court Chapter House Street York 0723

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 1; City Walls Bootham Bar To Monk Bar 0577

Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 2; 6 Chapter House Street York YO1 2JH 0725

Scheduled Ancient Monuments GMS Constraints: SMR 13280 York Minster Precinct Inc. Section Of City Walls

Schools GMS Constraints: St. Wilfrid's RC Primary 0230

2.2 Policies:

CYHE2

Development in historic locations

CYHE3

Conservation Areas

CYHE4

Listed Buildings

CYH4

Housing devp in existing settlements

CYHE10

Archaeology

CYHE11

Trees and landscape

CYGP4A
Sustainability

CYGP15
Protection from flooding

CYHE9
Scheduled Ancient Monuments

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 INTERNAL CONSULTATIONS

The following additional responses were received from internal consultees following consultation with the revised proposals-

Design, Conservation and Sustainable Development (Conservation Architect)- No objections subject to conditions.

3.2 EXTERNAL CONSULTATIONS

A re-consultation exercise has been carried out following receipt of the revised plans. The consultation period expires on 27 October 2010. Members will be updated of any responses that have been received to the date of the meeting.

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 KEY ISSUES

- Visual impact on the setting of the listed building, the host building, and the wider conservation area as a result of the revised details

4.2 RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

See previous report

ASSESSMENT

ALTERATIONS TO THE BUILDING:

4.3 The scheme for conversion of the building into a single dwelling house has been revised in accordance with advice set out in the Historic Environment Planning Practice Guide (PPS5 Planning for the Historic Environment), in particular paragraphs 185 & 186 which concern alterations to new openings (including roof lights) when buildings are being converted to new uses.

4.4 The existing building has a contrived utilitarian ground floor with an upper floor with a domestic appearance. It is considered that any alterations to the building should not over-domesticate the character of the building and retain as much of its utilitarian character on the ground floor as possible.

4.5 The proposed revisions relate to Drawing No. GC1/02/03 rev D and are outlined as follows:

ROOFLIGHTS-

- 1) two roof lights have been omitted on plan from the rear slope
- 2) the size of all roof lights has been reduced as they either serve bathrooms or give additional light to secondary spaces
- 3) the front roof light has been relocated to correspond with the otherwise unlit internal lobby

SOLAR PANELS-

- 4) solar panels have been retained on the rear slope and a condition should be attached requiring final agreement on size, type and assembly subject to calculations

OPENINGS-

- 5) the poor quality mid C20th ground floor window on the SE elevation has been amended to reflect the window on the gable facing the City Walls (9)
Accordingly a typical brick arch opening has been introduced.
- 6) A stable door format has been retained for the former stable door (16)
- 7) the continuous timber lintols have been retained
- 8) new ground floor windows/doors have been designed to be more consistent with each other
- 9) larger section framing has been used with glazed panels of squarer proportions to better reflect the utilitarian nature of previous openings

PORCH-

- 10) the porch has not been removed for two reasons: there is limited head room on the upper floor and therefore equipment served by the solar panels will need to be located on the ground floor; the porch would allow more space within the entrance corridor and enable the wide internal stable door opening to be retained. The revised design for the entrance door and side screens is bolder in appearance to be consistent with other revised openings. It is now

considered that the justification for the porch outweighs the harm. It is also a reversible addition

SITE ALTERATIONS AND ADDITIONAL DETAILS

- 11) the existing curtilage of the building has a mixture of flags and poor quality asphalt and concrete. Materials for hard landscape have been specified with the existing stone flags reused at entrance locations. Should other historic paving materials be found during the course of works these should be retained for reuse on site as appropriate
- 12) The revised plans show car parking for 2 cars with an additional space for visitors on the site of the removed planting bed that would be finished in reinforced grass. Members will be updated following further discussions about this proposal.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 On balance it is considered that the alterations to the building would be a significant improvement to a former service building, would allow the building to be re-used, whilst retaining the generosity of proportion and solidity of form that is a feature of the building.

5.2 Members are requested that officers are granted delegated authority to approve the application if there are no further objections which raise new issues as a result of the re-consultation exercise.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Delegated Authority to Approve

1 TIME2 Development start within three years

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following plans and other submitted details:-

Drawing No. GC1/02/03 Revision D, Received 11 October 2010

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 No development shall take place until full details of measures for bat mitigation and conservation have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority and a Natural England Protected Species Licence approving the mitigation measures must be submitted to the Local Planning Authority prior to any work taking place.

The measures shall include :

- i. A plan of how bats are to be dealt with during the conversion phase.
- ii. The inspection of any buildings to be demolished or disturbed as close to the date of work as possible and no earlier than one month prior to any work to ascertain the presence or otherwise of roosting or hibernating bats in the structure.
- iii. No buildings containing bats to be demolished until the bats have been safely excluded using previously agreed methods. By preference demolition should take place in winter when bats are not present.
- iv. Details of what provision is to be made within the new building to replace the features lost through the demolition of the original structure. Features suitable for incorporation for bats include the use of special tiles, bricks, soffit boards, bat lofts and bat boxes.
- v. The timing of all operations

The works shall be completed in accordance with the approved details prior to the occupation of the accommodation and shall be retained unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason - To take account of and enhance habitat for a protected species. It should be noted that under PPS9 the replacement/mitigation proposed should provide a nett gain in wildlife value.

4 No development shall commence unless and until details of provision for public open space facilities or alternative arrangements have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The Open space shall thereafter be provided in accordance with the approved scheme or the alternatives arrangements agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority and thereafter implemented, prior to first occupation of the development.

Reason: In order to comply with the provisions of Policy L1c of the Development Control Local Plan which requires that all new housing sites make provision for the open space needs of future occupiers.

INFORMATIVE:

The alternative arrangements of the above condition could be satisfied by the completion of a planning obligation made under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 by those having a legal interest in the application site, requiring a financial contribution towards off site provision of open space. The obligation should provide for a financial contribution calculated at £3006.00

No development can take place on this site until the public open space has been provided or the Planning Obligation has been completed and you are reminded of the local planning authority's enforcement powers in this regard.

5 Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, the following details shall be submitted for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority and thereafter the development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

(i) Large scale details and a schedule of new windows, doors and screens (internal and external). Details of any typical joinery elements shall be drawn at 1:20 and 1:5. The opening context (lintols, reveals, cills, thresholds) and set-backs shall also be specified.

(ii) Manufacturer's literature of the rooflights and solar panels. Maximum dimensions of both shall be specified and a section shall be provided showing the relationship between the solar panels and the slate covering.

(iii) Large scale of the porch, showing eaves and verge conditions and the relationship between new brickwork and framing. The porch shall not be toothed-in to the existing wall.

(iv) Large scale details of the new external boarding, showing its relationship with existing lintols and wall face

(v) Measures for upgrading acoustic or thermal performance of the fabric shall be specified. Drawings shall be submitted illustrating any changes.

(vi) A schedule of the proposed repairs. Any repairs and "making good" works shall be carried out to a high standard in materials and methods matching those of the original building

(vii) Samples of any new external building and landscaping materials

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with these details and in the interests of amenity

6 Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, a topographical survey showing the following drainage details shall be submitted for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority and thereafter the development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.

(i) A topographical survey showing the existing and proposed ground and finished floor levels to ordnance datum for the site and adjacent properties that demonstrates that the development shall not be raised above the level of the adjacent land, (to prevent runoff from the site affecting nearby properties) and that the proposed finished floor level shall be as the existing.

(ii) Existing and proposed surfacing details that ensure adequate drainage from the site

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with these details for the proper drainage of the site.

7 The development hereby approved shall be implemented and retained in accordance with the landscaping and car parking layout that shall be submitted for

the approval of the Local Planning Authority in writing prior to the commencement of the development, and no car parking shall take place on areas that are not designated as car parking areas without the approval of the Local Planning Authority in writing.

Reason: To ensure that external car parking does not compromise the amenity of the limited openness of the site and its tight relationship with the Scheduled Monument of the City Walls and the wider conservation area.

8. The existing garage and store within the application site shall be retained for the domestic use of the occupiers of the dwelling hereby approved.

Reason: In the interests of the amenity of the occupiers on the new dwelling hereby approved and the occupiers of the nearby residential properties.

9. If any historic surfacing materials are found during the course of works they shall be retained in-situ if practical. Otherwise they shall be recorded prior to lifting and then incorporated into a revised landscape scheme, drawings of which shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval prior to implementation.

Reason: In order that historic surfaces are retained in situ or if this is not possible that a permanent record of this part of the Grade I Listed Building is deposited in an established archive in the interests of its understanding which will provide an informed approach to manage the works to the Listed Building.

10. Prior to the commencement of the works hereby approve, a record of the existing basement and exterior shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority. This shall be a Level 1 record as contained in " Understanding Historic Buildings, A guide to good practice " 2006.

Reason: In order to deposit a permanent record of this part of the Listed Building in an established archive in the interests of its understanding which will provide an informed approach to manage the works to the Listed Building.

6.0 INFORMATIVES:

Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the special historic interest of the adjacent listed buildings, the character and appearance of the conservation area, visual and residential amenity. As such the proposal complies with Policies GP1, HE2, HE3, HE4, H3, HE9, HE10, HE11, GP15a, H4 and L1c of the City of York Development

Control Local Plan- Incorporating the Proposed 4th Set of Changes and related national guidance contained in Planning Policy Guidance Notes No 3 " Housing " and No. 15 "Planning and the Historic Environment" and Planning Policy Statement No. 1 "

2. PARTY WALL INFORMATIVE

You are advised that the development may involve building work covered by the Party Wall etc Act 1996 that is separate from planning or building regulations control. Do not commence work on the development until you comply with the provisions of this Act. An explanatory booklet may be obtained from the City of York's Department of City Strategy, or alternatively it is available on the Department of Communities and Local Government, www.communities.gov.uk.

Contact details:

Author: Fiona Mackay Development Management Officer (Wed - Fri)

Tel No: 01904 552407